

WWP Series

CASE STUDY

Professional training challenges: the Pronatec/BSM experience in Senador Canedo, Brazil

Sergio Paganini Martins



WWP

WORLD WITHOUT POVERTY
BRAZIL LEARNING INITIATIVE

WWP SERIES

CASE STUDY

Professional training challenges: the Pronatec/BSM experience in Senador Canedo, Brazil

Sergio Paganini Martins

This study case is part of a series of studies
by the Brazil Learning Initiative for a World without Poverty (WWP).
Brasília, 2016

LIST OF ACRONYMS

BPC	Continuous Welfare Benefit for the Elderly and Disabled
BSM	Brazil without Extreme Poverty Plan
Caged	General Registry for Employed and Unemployed
CS	Case Study
CRAS	Reference Center for Social Assistance
CREAS	Specialized Reference Center for Social Assistance
EJA	Youth and Adult Education
FNDE	National Fund for Educational Development
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
IBGE	Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics
Inep	Anisio Teixeira National Institute for Educational Studies and Research
IPC-IG/PNUD	International Policy Center for Inclusive Growth of the United Nations Development Program
Ipea	Institute for Applied Economic Research
MDSA	Ministry of Social and Agrarian Development
MEC	Ministry of Education
MEI	Individual Entrepreneur
MTE	Ministry of Labor and Employment
OGU	Federal General Budget
PBF	Bolsa Familia Program (Family Grant Program)
PNAD	National Household Sample Survey
PNAE	National School Feeding Program
PNAP	National Professional Learning Plan
Pronatec	National Program for Access to Professional Education and Employment
Protege	Special Care Program (carried out by CREAS to address the youth)
RAIS	Annual List of Social Information
SAGI/MDSA	Secretariat of Information Evaluation and Management of the Ministry of Social and Agrarian Development
Sedea	Municipal Secretariat of Economic Development and Agriculture (of Senador Canedo)
Seduc	Municipal Secretariat of Education and Culture (of Senador Canedo)
Semasc	Municipal Secretariat for Social Assistance and Housing (of Senador Canedo)
Semtrar	Municipal Secretariat of Labor and Income (of Senador Canedo)
Senar	National Rural Learning Service
Sesc	Social Service of Commerce
Sesi	Social Service of the Industry
Sine	National Employment System
Sistec	Professional Education Information System
SNAS/MDSA	National Secretariat for Social Assistance of the Ministry of Social and Agrarian Development
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
WWP	Brazil Learning Initiative for a World without Poverty

Summary

1	Case Study Introduction	6
2	Case Study Context.....	8
3	Implementation Process.....	10
4	Case Study Lessons.....	18
	References.....	21

Acknowledgment

The organizers deeply thanks the collaboration of the people who found time in their routines to make possible the publication of this study.

Abstract

The Case Study on the experience of Senador Canedo, state of Goiás, shows the municipality has broadened, improved and made permanent the actions geared towards professional education and productive inclusion based on the expertise accumulated during the implementation of Pronatec. The work strategies and methods adopted to mobilize, monitor and motivate beneficiaries of professional training to enter the labor market have been important to increase the participation of the most vulnerable population. The implementation of professional education has taken on a more inclusive character after significant changes were made in terms of staff skills, the proper distribution of tasks among agencies - what led to changes in institutional culture -, development of capabilities and skills to make partnerships, provision of personnel and earmarking of resources etc. The expansion of professional training coordinated with the Youth and Adult Education Program (EJA) was translated into gains and lessons learned for the parties involved. However, in order to put it into practice, the municipal education system required a higher degree of organization and partnerships had to be established. This Case Study points out the factors that have turned professional education and incentives to enter the market into permanent services for social assistance

CASE STUDY INTRODUCTION

The municipality of Senador Canedo was emancipated in 1988. It is located within the metropolitan region of Goiânia and, since its creation, has shown quick population and economic growth. It is notably urban (its urban population went from 94.99% in 2000 to 99.61% in 2010), and agriculture accounts for only 0.3% of GDP. The service sector represents two thirds of its economy. The industry has seen a recent expansion, having a significant petrochemical activity as well as furniture and shoes manufacturing, both important industries in terms of the amount of jobs created. The economy has grown considerably between 2005 and 2010, with GDP going up 74.3% (greater than the state of Goiás, which grew 69.4% in the same period)¹.

The last few years have witnessed fast demographic growth, greater than state and regional averages, which is the result of a migratory flow of people looking for work opportunities. According to IBGE² estimates, the

city's population reached 100,367 in 2015, with annual growth (since 2000) of 4.76%, a much higher rate than state, regional and national averages. According to the 2010 Demographic Census, the extreme poverty rate was 8.82%. This means 14,618 families were listed on the Unified Registry, of which 5,164 were beneficiaries of the Bolsa Familia Program (coverage of 115.47% of the total estimated families who meet the program's income criterion). This scenario pushes the demand for public services, especially those related to social assistance, whose network is composed of two Reference Centers for Social Assistance (CRAS) and one Specialized Reference Center for Social Assistance (CREAS).

Given the economic and demographic dynamic of the city, the last two municipal administrations have given special attention to professional education and employment assistance, helping workers enter the formal market as an instrument of social development and inclusion.

1. Data gathered in the SAGI/MDSA Newsletters. Available at RAIS: http://aplicacoes.mds.gov.br/sagi-data/METRO/metro_ds.php?p_id=233 and CAGED: http://aplicacoes.mds.gov.br/sagi-data/METRO/metro_ds.php?p_id=444. Retrieved on 23/06/2016.

2. Data retrieved from www.ibge.gov.br/home/estatistica/populacao/censo2010/ on 23/06/2016.



CASE STUDY CONTEXT

The Case Study on the experience of Senador Canedo was proposed in order to identify the major measures and strategies implemented in the Pronatec Brazil Without Extreme Poverty program (Pronatec/BSM), aimed at improving the participants' level of schooling, coordinating actions of professional training and working with other existing institutional arrangements, as well as maintaining a relationship with beneficiaries.

After professional education courses were made available, and expanded compared to historical figures, the municipality saw improvements in productive inclusion of the most vulnerable. Work procedures initially adopted were not able to prioritize the participation of the poorer population. Hence, municipal managers have reassessed their administration procedures in order to be better prepared to identify and understand the specific needs of the population listed on the Unified Registry so they could take part in training courses and improve their chances of accessing the labor market. In this context, professional education was associated to EJA and other actions.

The strategy adopted by the city administration to tackle development challenges consists of promoting productive inclusion as a means to improve the lives of the most vulnerable segments of the population. Professional education, consolidated as a permanent service provided by social assistance policies, is under the responsibility of the Municipal Secretariat for Social Assistance and Housing (Semasc). The development of methods, capabilities and skills was based on the expertise obtained from the implementation of Pronatec/BSM between 2012 and 2015. Before that, some professional education activities were carried out in the city, but Pronatec broadened their scope and focused them on the most vulnerable people. With respect to professional education actions, the main challenge faced by the municipality is precisely the provision of services to the poorer population, who have lower incomes and lower levels of schooling, so that they can effectively generate productive inclusion.

The starting point of this Case Study was the identification of the institutions involved, as well as the actions and instruments used to identify the needs of the target public and the reality of the labor market in terms of demand for skilled labor. In this regard, Semasc stands out for its key role in dealing directly with families and for the methods used to mobilize and

select participants, all crucial steps to ensure the right people joined the courses. Another remarkable factor was the work of the Municipal Secretariat of Labor and Income (Semtrar) in establishing a close relationship between the city administration and local businesses and industry. They did that by working daily with local corporations' human resources departments, learning about their needs and providing access to available job positions.

Moreover, the way in which the municipality works to improve schooling levels is note-worthy, especially with regard to EJA. The government's approach considers the needs of beneficiaries and seeks to minimize the effects of their historic needs. The market demands more and more in terms of workers' level of schooling. Semasc and Semtrar are municipal agencies that work day-to-day with citizen care; when they see a need for improvement, they provide guidance and refer people to enroll in EJA initiatives. Seduc proved to be capable of meeting the demand for better education and identifying the needs of the less educated population by associating professional training and primary education EJA in a partnership with Sesi/Senai. Also, the Family in EJA project should be noted as a significant initiative to help students overcome, at least partially, their chronic difficulties in attending and completing courses, by receiving and taking care of students' children under 12 who have nowhere to stay while their parents attend class. In addition, the provision of school transportation and meals are also important tools for creating better conditions for their attendance and reducing desertion rates.

The third part of the analysis relates to the beneficiary profiles. Even if most beneficiaries of Pronatec/BSM in the first courses were not exactly the ones who need the most income-wise, the very changes adopted by municipal agencies in terms of mobilization and screening practices have contributed to change the scenario. To ensure priority was given to the most socially vulnerable segments, methods for mobilizing the public, selecting participants, monitoring the courses and including them in the labor market had to be changed.

This is an overview of the context, implementation processes and lessons derived from this experience, which maps and records the major measures and strategies adopted to provide professional education to the most vulnerable segments of the population of Senador Canedo

3



IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS

3.1 Scope of action

The improvements in the implementation process of professional education and productive inclusion public policies in Senador Canedo may be described concretely by the adoption of a set of demeanors and procedures, including: i) the search for more convergence between the profile of courses offered and the demands of the companies present in the city; ii) greater participation of vulnerable segments of the population, often left aside for they do not find enough support and help to enter and remain in the courses; iii) the adoption of procedures for monitoring students' attendance and performance, thus reducing factors that lead to desertion; iv) reinforcing the value of completing professional training and the benefits for students, their families and friends; v) making support funds available so beneficiaries may seek their productive inclusion, be it by entering the formal market or becoming an entrepreneur.

An emblematic action implemented by Seduc and Senai in the context of expanding professional education was combining professional training and EJA for all students attending the third semester of primary education. This took place only in 2015, given the lack of resources to keep the initiative going. In spite of that, benefits in terms of learning were clear, as stated in interviews with beneficiaries. The greater scale of professional education in Senador Canedo after Pronatec was an important vector for the partnership that makes the initiative possible.

The set of measures adopted in professional education and productive inclusion described below shows a context in which municipal management was able to develop capabilities and carry out institutional adjustments that made it easier for them to perform these activities, thus prioritizing the participation of vulnerable families to improve their livelihoods.

By observing the initiatives undertaken by the municipality and how they complement each other, it is possible to see the relationship between the actions developed by local government agencies. In practice, this means having an institutional arrangement prepared

to deal with this part of the population and capable of acting effectively in all stages of the productive inclusion process.

3.2 What made the difference

The program's delivery, in other words, the provision of professional education to low-income and less educated populations, presented significant challenges for the city administration (delivery challenges). In Semasc, the mobilization work – including active search through family visits, individual consultations at social assistance services and other kinds of support offered to problem solving – was aimed at guiding families so they were able to access professional education. During the courses, there was also intensive work to reduce desertion rates, keep attendance high and ensure conclusion. In Semtrar, concrete support measures are basic but highly important for those who wish to enter the formal labor market. In Seduc, the most important example of support provided is the Family in EJA project. The set of actions developed by each secretariat make up a wholesome approach put forth by the city administration when dealing with delivery challenges.

3.3 Pronatec as a starting point

The National Program for Access to Technical Education and Employment (Pronatec)³ was created by the Federal Government in 2011, aimed at expanding, embedding, and democratizing professional and technological education, improving the quality of secondary education and broadening educational opportunities for workers. The program has generated important synergies and helped building capacities in Senador Canedo in terms of professional education and the inclusion of the most vulnerable population.

The program entails an instrument, funded by the Ministry of Education (MEC), called *Bolsa-Formação*⁴. This instrument consists of free onsite secondary education technical courses - of both initial and continued education - offered to public professional and technological education institutions, national learning services and private higher and professional education institutions accredited by MEC.

3. Pronatec was established by Act nº 12.513, as of Oct 26, 2011. Retrieved from <http://portal.mec.gov.br/pronatec> on 02/07/2016

4. Bolsa-Formação (Education Grant) was established by Act nº 12.513, 2011, and regulated by Ordinance MEC nº 168, as of March 7, 2013.

3.3.1 Pronatec Brazil Without Extreme Poverty

Pronatec Brazil Without Extreme Poverty (BSM) is intended at offering initial and continued education courses (FIC)⁵ to the most vulnerable segments of the Brazilian society, as a means to improve their possibilities of productive inclusion. Students must be at least 16 years old and registered on the Unified Registry, preferably from families who are part of the Bolsa Familia Program.

FICs and professional training courses are geared mainly towards people in situation of social vulnerability, those that have been historically excluded from school. The goal is to better organize the offering of courses according to the needs and interests of this public, taking into account the needs of each social and economic group. The productive inclusion strategy of BSM proposes three options of decent insertion in the labor market: employment, individual entrepreneurship and solidarity economy.

Courses are funded by the Federal Government through transfers made directly to teaching units and students are not charged for anything. Municipal governments that wish to participate must apply to Pronatec. No matching funds are required on their part, only a commitment to coordinate actions with teaching institutions, mobilize the Unified Registry candidates, monitor students' performance and integrate employment and income policies to other productive inclusion and sectoral policies (health, education etc.).

Senador Canedo joined Pronatec BSM soon after its implementation in 2012 and joint efforts allowed for the training of 2,242 beneficiaries by the end of 2015. Prior to Pronatec, the municipality already offered professional education courses, therefore, the program meant boosting, broadening and enhancing the execution of already-existing initiatives, from the initial offering of courses to the actual productive inclusion of beneficiaries. This process includes several stages involving concepts, positive and negative aspects and critical decisions, all described herein.

3.4 Defining the offering of courses

When implementing Pronatec, municipalities are free to define the courses they deem relevant to their social and economic context and to their local development strategies. In the beginning of Pronatec in Senador Canedo, local managers

were confronted with a few difficulties, which also meant a good opportunity to work out the best method for them. These were the major difficulties found: i) the courses originally proposed for the service sector (baker, concierge and security guard, receptionist etc.) did not draw much attention and it was difficult to fill all vacancies; ii) the socially vulnerable public who should be prioritized did not have the complete required documentation for enrollment, given the large presence of migrants. These difficulties arose mainly because candidates did not have their school transcripts to prove they could attend the course; iii) candidates did not meet schooling requirements to participate; iv) CRAS staff had little knowledge about the contents and conditions for taking courses, which affected their capacity to provide clear information to those interested.

As a means to match the Pronatec/BSM offering with family needs and the market capacity to absorb the trained labor force, course selection was based on an annual plan elaborated by the Municipal Secretariat of Social Assistance and Citizenship (Semasc). The Municipal Secretariat of Employment and Income (Semtrar) was then the first agency to receive a list of all courses available, in order to match the offering with local market demands. During this process, the demands of CRAS, Pró-Jovem and other social assistance services were considered, as well as those identified by Seduc. To offer more courses, new teaching units were made available (aside from Sesi/Senai also Sesc and Senar). A fruitful dialogue was established with all teaching institutions and Semasc carried out staff training aimed at teaching about Pronatec so workers could better understand its functioning and provide quality information to the population.

3.5 Participation of the most vulnerable segments

When implementing Pronatec, the municipality is free to mobilize the public - especially the most vulnerable segments of the population - in accordance to their peculiarities and resources available. Considering the main target public of Pronatec/BSM, people are mobilized and screened based on the Unified Registry information. In order to increase the participation of the most vulnerable, Semasc adopted different strategies, which can be classified as massive, specifically oriented (so-called "active search") and based on demand. The mobilization process

5. Courses with at least 160 hours that accept students with complete or incomplete primary education (in the later years) - depending on the course.

was carried out with support services capable of registering the demand for professional education, guiding and referring main issues for solution.

The largest communication strategy was undertaken through meetings to discuss how the Unified Registry could work as a public policy instrument and to expose the inclusion and permanence criteria for the PBF and Pronatec. The main goal was to address participants' concerns about losing PBF benefits if they participated in Pronatec/BSM. This concern meant a significant setback for the participation of the vulnerable population in Pronatec, especially in the beginning.

Another mechanism for identifying demand was the work of social assistance services. When interviewing services, staff members recorded the person's data (name, date of birth, phone number, e-mail, home address, courses they were interested in and time of preference), so they could contact them (home visits or over the phone) whenever a course was available. In many occasions, this strategy served for filling vacancies needed to complete a class.

The addition of new managers and professionals to Semasc's team, thanks to *Acessuas Trabalho*⁶, made it necessary for the municipality to review its work methods and train the staff especially with regard to capacities and skills necessary to work with families and identify their weaknesses and needs. The changes made in their work dynamics and in the methods for developing activities generated support services better prepared to deal with vulnerable populations and capable of addressing the chronic issues they face in order to enter and stay in courses.

The remodeled professional education activities, which achieved a higher participation of vulnerable segments, have been associated with productive inclusion actions undertaken mainly by Semtrar. In cases where students need to go back to school, they are referred to Seduc and its network. The need of these students is what led to the association of EJA and professional education.

In summary, three elements have made it possible to provide quality education services for the most vulnerable population in Senador Canedo: i) the progress achieved in terms of management capacities of social assistance services in the municipality, with investments in staff training aimed at family interviews (as well as home visits, when applicable) to identify the most suitable courses to their profiles; ii) a good infrastructure to serve the population already installed in CRAS and CREAS facilities; iii) the implementation of *Acessuas Trabalho*. This means the mobilization work had support services for screening and guiding participants, preparing their documentation, referring them to specific services (health clinics or schools, when applicable), allowing priority groups to have access to professional training courses as a permanent social assistance service. The program's outreach was enhanced by the implementation of pre-enrollment units in municipal schools.

According to managers, these measures made it possible to overcome delivery challenges for the participation of the most vulnerable segments of the population and have boosted the city administration's actions towards professional education, increasing its value as a permanent social assistance service.

3.6 Course attendance monitoring

Several factors strongly influence course attendance, among which are going to classes and working - or searching for work - at the same time, taking care of younger children, health problems in the family, difficulty to adapt to the institutional culture of the teaching unit or difficulty to keep up with class content. The municipal social assistance network is responsible for monitoring course participants based on attendance and performance reports provided by the teaching unit. With this data and through permanent communication with the teaching institutions, municipal managers and the *Acessuas Trabalho* team develop a systematic monitoring system of participants, thus identifying the cases when there is a need for support in terms of attendance or desertion.

6. *Acessuas Trabalho* is a program implemented by the MDSA that reached the municipality in June 2013. The program transferred Federal Government resources to municipalities for productive inclusion activities geared towards social assistance beneficiaries. A staff of four people worked on it: one coordinator, two social science professionals (a social worker and a psychologist) and one administrative assistant. This team coordinated several social assistance services related to professional education actions developed by the city government or in partnerships, thus contributing for significant progress of Pronatec/BSM in this municipality.

So that participants can fully participate in the courses, Pronatec/BSM offers student grants to help them pay for transportation and meals and attend courses. This is given directly by the teaching unit, in cash, bus and train tickets and food. Teaching units must also provide materials needed for the courses, such as uniforms, textbooks, notebooks and pens.

3.6.1 Monitoring steps and methods

The beginning of the course is a crucial moment for motivating students to attend classes. Since most of them have been out of school for a reasonable amount of time, the city government and the teaching unit offer an “opening class” for each course, especially designed to raise their awareness and encourage attendance, thus avoiding early desertion. Moreover, this first class is an opportunity for teachers and administrative staff members to get acquainted with a public they are not used to.

The Acessuas team monitors beneficiaries during courses. To do that, they have set up psychosocial groups aimed at fostering and motivating students, being close to them and actively listening to their issues. Participants often appreciate this opportunities and become more aware of their own qualities, abilities and potential. The psychosocial group also intends to strengthen student’s identity and follows a schedule of technical visits to monitor courses. Acessuas monitoring is aimed at reducing desertion rates (which are between 10% and 15%), which, according to teaching units, are quite low for this type of courses.

Since most beneficiaries have never had the opportunity to study in regular schools and feel proud to finish a course, the municipal government of Senador Canedo carries out a final assessment session and a graduation ceremony. The assessment is done in a participatory manner – in most cases very informally – or simply through an evaluation form. The data obtained serve as the basis for planning new training activities.

3.7 Permanent offering of professional training and incentive to enter the market

Pronatec has boosted actions already put forth by the municipal government. Between 2012 and 2015, a total of 40 courses were

offered in 20 different areas. After the peak of Pronatec in 2014 (20 courses), the supply curve declined, which made the city government seek new ways to meet the demand, since professional education had already been embedded as a permanent social assistance activity. In 2015, this demand was supplied with courses offered under the so-called “free-of-charge”⁷ modality (gratuidade), based on partnerships with teaching units. Once the municipality stopped providing new courses, frustration grew among the population, who constantly seeks training both in CRAS and in other social assistance institutions. Semasc decided to set up a municipal unit for providing professional education courses, called Central de Cursos (Course Central). This unit counts on the work of the Acessuas staff (paid with city government’s funds), facilities provided by the State government and equipment purchased for certain courses. The unit has also established permanent partnerships and uses its own resources to offer professional education courses in many areas. The resources for professional courses come from the PBF share they receive according to their IGD⁸. In order to use these resources, courses must prioritize PBF beneficiaries.

Senador Canedo’s government carries out important labor intermediation actions, by negotiating job vacancies with companies and supporting workers so they can have access to these jobs. These work and income opportunities are presented to beneficiaries through lectures given by institutions at the end of the courses. After that, Semtrar gets in touch with each graduated student and calls them for a meeting at its offices, where they access services and resources available. This support includes guidance, technical support for writing their résumé, preparing documentation and scheduling interviews. These simple actions are very important and are part of the follow-up process that looks at how people are accessing the market and identifies those that have not been able to find a job and the reasons why. Municipal workers are instructed to work with beneficiaries in such way as to provide them more autonomy, so they can develop their own capacities to deal with these situations.

7. These are courses offered in several technological areas required by the market aimed at low-income youth looking for their first job, people that have already entered the job market or people willing to learn new skills. Textbooks and uniforms are free of charge for these courses.

8. The Bolsa *Familia* Program’s Decentralized Management Index (IGD) is an indicator that shows the quality of local management for the program and for the Unified Registry, thus reflecting the commitments undertaken by the municipality when joining the program. The index goes from 0 to 1. The closer to 1, the better the result for the management assessment. Based on this indicator, MDSA calculates the amount of resources to be transferred to the municipality.

These actions reinforce their relationship with local companies, promote productive inclusion of segments of the population in need of employment and help the city's economic development.

These elements help to measure the city's readiness in maintaining permanent professional education actions and providing access to the labor market, focusing on the most vulnerable population.

3.8 First incentive to entrepreneurship

Besides entering the formal market, productive inclusion initiatives include guidance to becoming an individual microentrepreneur (MEI), when this is found to be the most suitable option. The first stage in this process is a lecture given by Sedeia (working in partnership with the Brazilian Micro and Small Business Support Service) for professional education participants, in which they explain the procedures and advantages of formalizing their business. This guidance is given before they access credit lines⁹, when there is a need for resources to finance their business. In this case, Banco do Povo (People's Bank) provides funds to small entrepreneurs that have lived in the city for at least three years and have certified training for that business activity (a Pronatec certificate may testify to that). The operational process for the business is undertaken in a partnership between the city and the State governments.

3.9 Increased schooling and professional education

Considering the scale of operations and the variety of professional education initiatives, Senador Canedo developed an institutional

culture and built capacities to face the issue of professional training and low schooling levels, sorting out to alternatives capable of stimulating school attendance of young people and adults. EJA students of different age groups and labor conditions were looking for ways to improve their skills to join the labor market. Seduc proposed EJA to be combined with professional education for all students in the third semester (equivalent to the beginning of 8th grade in primary school). This proposal would help the municipality meet the goal of the National Education Plan (PNE), which sets a goal of a 25% rate of enrollments in professional training¹⁰.

3.9.1 Partnership, costs and implementation conditions

Seduc had to sign a partnership in order to offer professional education, since it did not have resources to hire professionals and experts in the course's areas of knowledge nor the expertise to do it themselves. Managers believed the scale of Pronatec in the city was such as to make possible for Sesi/Senai to participate, so they made a commitment to fund these costs, especially related to staff. On the other hand, Sesi/Senai saw this initiative as worthy of participation and their long-standing partnership with the city government justified the allocation of their own resources for the program. Therefore, the partnership came into effect even if motivations were different. In the agreement, input costs were paid by the city, which already had the equipment needed for courses in some areas. Courses were given in the first and second semesters of 2015. It was not possible to continue in 2016 because neither Senai nor the city could afford the expenses, so it was discontinued.

9. Banco do Povo offers credit lines for machinery, equipment, tools, furniture and accessories (new), goods for resale and/or raw materials between R\$ 500,00 (at least) and R\$ 10.000,00 (at most), monthly interest rates of 0.25%, grace periods of 3 (three) months and up to 36 months of payment deadline.

10. The National Education Plan (PNE), approved on June 26, 2014, is a ten-year plan, which establishes the guidelines, goals and strategies for education initiatives. States and municipalities must develop specific plans to reach the agreed goals— considering the local situation, demands and needs. Goal nº 10 is “EJA integrated with Professional Education” and established the following: “Offering at least 25% (twenty five per cent) of the enrollments in professional education integrated with youth and adult vacancies in primary and middle schools”.

Table 1: Data on the number of enrollments and desertions in the third semester of EJA, in 2014 (without professional courses) and 2015 (with professional courses)

School	Students enrolled and desertion					
	Enrollment in 2014		Desertion (%)	Enrollment in 2015		Desertion (%)
	Beginning (nº)	End (nº)		Beginning (nº)	End (nº)	
Aracy Amaral	60	32	46,6	66	38	42,4
Luzia Maria de Siqueira	137	126	8,1	83	72	13,3
Senador Canedo	108	82	24,1	134	118	11,9
Vovó Dulce	78	51	34,6	72	50	30,6
Total	305	240	21,3	283	228	19,4

Source: elaborated by the author, with data available at the Education Board of Seduc in Senador Canedo/GO

Directors at Seduc have seen an increase in student attendance and a reduction in desertion rates, which have been historically high. Data on enrollments in the third period of EJA in 2014 (a year prior to combining EJA with professional education) and 2015 (when they were combined) allow us to see the number of students enrolled at the beginning and those graduated in the end of the semester. In fact, the desertion rate simply based on the number of enrollments in the beginning and end was smaller in 2015 (19%) compared to 2014 (21%). However, without a detailed assessment, one cannot say the reduction in 2015 is due professional education being combined with EJA.

The municipality has a well-structured education system with an active Council and Forum and a regular Municipal Fund, which made it easier to carry out this initiative. The pedagogical proposal was elaborated with the participation of teachers and the Sesi/Senai technical team, and then sent to the Municipal Education Council, which quickly analyzed it and issued a favorable report.

In the formula adopted, each class was presented with a set of 120-hour courses. The class would then hold a majority vote and decide which course they would take twice a week. Professional course attendance was mandatory; but professional education could not be used as a score to make students fail in EJA.

3.9.2 Opportunities and restrictions

The major challenge in coordinating EJA and professional training at primary education level was to harmonize course hours, since professional courses were added to an already busy schedule of primary education classes. It was difficult to match these two, since it was not possible to increase school hours for the students and EJA does not allow classes on Saturdays, which forced the new workload to be distributed on five days of the week. Partners chose to share the course content among EJA teachers and Sesi/Senai experts, considering that the hands-on classes of professional courses could also serve as an opportunity to put into practice what they had learned in EJA.

The interviews have shown synergy in both learning modalities, and professional education contributed to reinforce the contents learned in the regular course curricula. Hence, professional courses were given in the third semester of their regular classes, so that any learning deficit in EJA could be dealt with in the last semester.

3.9.3 Family in EJA Project

This project is 11 years old and makes it possible for students to take their children to school if they have no one to take care of them. There, they will find professionals (education agents) who receive children up to 12 years old and carry out playful activities with them.

Meals, known as jantinha (small supper), are served to those who go to class straight from work, and both parents and children can eat. The city government also provides a shuttle service to make it easier for EJA students to get to school. They also receive school materials, a kit with school uniform (two t-shirts), notebooks, textbooks, ruler, protractor, set square, pens, pencils etc.

The Family in EJA project, together with the shuttle service and meals, are a set of supports offered to EJA students to face the usual challenges of low-income beneficiaries to start and remain in courses until the end, such as not having support to take care of their children during school hours.

4

CASE STUDY LESSONS

The experience in Senador Canedo provides lessons learned in different stages of professional education implementation and development of productive inclusion actions. The awareness of municipal managers in identifying the difficulties of low-income beneficiaries to enter and finish professional education courses has led to important progress in the provision of social assistance services by local government.

First, improvements were made in planning and structuring mobilization efforts and the active search of families through home visits as a means to provide the most vulnerable population with quality access to courses. In order to provide proper support to the demand created by these new actions, municipal staff was trained to deal with the most common issues affecting the participation of the population in professional education by offering solutions to mitigate or overcome these issues. This process has changed the quality of citizen service and improved responsiveness to the need of this sector of the population, by means of guidance and specific referrals based on each case. Systematic monitoring of participants was also enhanced with actions from the beginning to the end of the courses, which has helped to reduce desertion rates. After finishing the courses, support has been given for their inclusion in the labor market with individual assistance to those trying to find a job and concrete actions that stimulate their autonomy in elaborating résumés, preparing the documentation and scheduling job interviews. Coupled with that, those willing to become individual entrepreneurs may also find support through guidance and easier access to credit lines aimed at production. These actions compose a wholesome approach to tackle the challenge of inserting the most vulnerable and less educated population in the market.

Linking actions and sharing responsibilities among different agencies in this process (Semasc, Semtrar, Seduc and Sedea) helped fulfilling the institutional mission of each one of them and established synergies, creating an institutional arrangement capable to promote the participation of the vulnerable population in the

process of professional education and productive inclusion.

Pronatec broadened the city's scope of action related to professional education, which led to developing its capacities, building an institutional culture and establishing partnerships to make professional education and productive inclusion permanent services within social assistance policies in Senador Canedo. The creation of the Course Central unit and the upkeep of the Acessuas Trabalho team with municipal funds, even after the significant reduction of courses offered by Pronatec, are clear indicators of the actions' sustainability and shows that there is a systematic work process developed for improving families' income and living conditions, as part of the development challenges that need to be addressed.

Offering professional education together with EJA (starting in primary school) may provide lessons about new models to promote professional training. The formula adopted presents elements that seem to contribute for improving the quality of education and reducing desertion rates. Home visits (10) and interviews with a few students (4) have shown that one of the benefits of professional education is the synergy among course curricula, thus providing opportunities for the practical application of theoretical content taught in class. On the other hand, interviewees have not sought market insertion in the areas they had trained for, due to specific and different types of reasons. Moreover, they did not see any significant change in their lives after the courses. The formula adopted in Senador Canedo presents high implementation costs which are somehow incompatible with the municipal action in education. In order to ensure quality education, specialized professionals must be hired for each areas of knowledge covered by the courses, which increase costs that in this case were funded by Sesi/Senai. Considering the complexity of the several aspects at play, one should be cautious when passing judgement on the validity of associating professional training with EJA in primary education. In order to reach conclusions, a more encompassing assessment

must be undertaken considering implementation costs and outcomes in terms of trained workforce and their inclusion in the labor market, taking into account that employers have been increasingly demanding regarding schooling levels, showing preference for workers that have at least finished secondary education, even for simple jobs.

Among lessons learned, one must consider the gaps identified in the monitoring and assessment of the actions undertaken. There

is no systematic procedure for monitoring the outcomes of professional training, nor figures related to productive inclusion and, most importantly, access to the market, all important data for building performance indicators to help improving management processes. This is an important limitation for the assessment of outcomes. Finally, it is important to mention that the institutional arrangement is not regulated, therefore, there is no legal instrument that defines the attributions of each agency nor a collegiate body for sharing decisions.

References

BRAZIL. Ministry of Social Development and Fight against Hunger. Secretariat for Information Assessment and Management. *Technical document*. Brasília, DF: MDS, November 2013. Content: a) Report on the field work undertaken, with interviews and focal groups carried out; b) Report with the transcripts of focal groups and interviews; c) Electronic copy of audio recordings of focal groups and interviews. Midwest and North Regions. Product 2 regarding the “Qualitative study of graduated and deserters, representatives of teaching units and city government actors of Pronatec/BSM”. Consultant Júlia Moretto Amâncio.

Cadernos de Estudos Desenvolvimento Social em Debate, n. 24. Brasília, DF: Ministry of Social Development and Fight against Hunger, 2015. Available at: <http://portal.mec.gov.br/index.php?option=com_docman&view=download&alias=17796-caderno-de-estudos-24-inclusao-produtiva-urbana&Itemid=30192>. Retrieved on 27 October 2016.

_____. *Analysis report and Executive Summary*. Brasília, DF: MDS, April 2014. Shows and analysis of collected data, main results and recommendations for Pronatec-BSM management. Midwest and North Region. Product 3 regarding the “Qualitative study of graduated and deserters, representatives of teaching units and city government actors of Pronatec/BSM”. Consultant Júlia Moretto Amâncio.

_____. *Product 4 - Final document*. Brasília, DF: MDS, May/December 2015. Content: a) Description and analysis of productive inclusion actions selected from Product 2, especially the role of stakeholders and the institution context that allowed its implementation and development. b) Results, factors of success and its replicability in international cases. Consultant Andrea Perotti Harrop - interviews carried out in May 2015 and the text was organized in December 2015.

MAASSEN A., BATHANTI J. *Guidelines for Delivery Case Studies*. Used by the World Bank and its partners within the Global Delivery Initiative.



www.wwp.org