



WWP

WORLD WITHOUT POVERTY
BRAZIL LEARNING INITIATIVE



WWP Series Productive Inclusion Reports

**PRONATEC BRAZIL WITHOUT EXTREME
POVERTY (BRASIL SEM MISÉRIA)
SALVADOR – BA**

WWP Series Productive Inclusion Reports¹

Pronatec Brazil Without Extreme Poverty (Brasil Sem Miséria)

Salvador – BA²

1. INTRODUCTION

One of the main productive inclusion actions involved in the Brazil Without Extreme Poverty Plan (Plano Brasil Sem Miséria), is the National Program for Access to Technical Education and Employment (Pronatec, in Portuguese), which provides free professional certification programs for people on the Unified Registry (*Cadastro Único*)³ through Initial and Continuing Training courses with a minimum of 160 class hours. Altogether, the courses are known as the Pronatec Brazil Without Extreme Poverty Plan (Pronatec BSM).

In 2015, the Municipal Secretariat for Social Development and Combating Poverty (SEMPS, in the original acronym) was the body responsible for managing Pronatec BSM in Salvador, the capital of the state of Bahia.

Other actors involved in implementing the program in the municipality include the Municipal Labor Intermediation Service (SIMM, in the original acronym), tied to the Secretary of Labor Development and Employment (SEDES, in Portuguese), and the provider institutions for the Pronatec BSM courses, such as the National Service for Industry Education (SENAI, in the original acronym) and Trade Education (SENAC, in the original acronym), and the Federal Institute of Bahia (IFBA, in the original acronym).

Salvador's experience in implementing Pronatec reveals the path of social welfare policy in designing strategies for the program to reach the poorest and most vulnerable populations in the municipality.

1 The WWP Series of Productive Inclusion Reports delves into the process to plan and implement urban and rural productive inclusion activities conducted by Brazilian state and municipal governments. In the context of the Brazil Without Extreme Poverty Plan (Plano Brasil Sem Miséria) created in 2011 to help Brazil overcome extreme poverty, the government understands productive inclusion to refer to improving capacities, job opportunities, and income for the poorest families in both rural and urban areas.

2 This document was drafted based on a technical visit conducted by the WWP's productive inclusion consultant Andrea Perotti in May 2015.

3 The federal government's Unified Registry for Social Programs is a tool to identify and track the socioeconomic profiles of low-income families. It is also used to select beneficiaries for social policies and programs and to map deficiencies and vulnerabilities.

The key highlights of this report include:

- Permeating and mobilizing the target audience to enroll in the Pronatec BSM courses through actions at 28 basic protection social welfare units.
- Decentralization and engagement of public and community institutions in pre-enrollment.

2. INSTITUTIONAL CONTEXT

- **Implementation period:** Since 2011.
- **Implementation location:** Salvador, the capital of the state of Bahia, the regional metropolis located on the northeastern coast of Brazil. In 2010, the total municipality population amounted to 2.6 million people, the third largest in Brazil. Nearly 5.2% of the municipal population lives in extreme poverty, and 99.9% of the residents are urban dwellers. As of November 2015, 19.25% of the local population was receiving benefits from the Family Grant (Bolsa Família⁴) program
- **Main actors involved:**
 - SEMPS, the body responsible for managing Pronatec BSM and subsequently, for all the other aspects of the program.
 - SIMM, tied to SEDES;

⁴ Direct cash transfer program for families living in poverty or extreme poverty, subject to certain conditions related to healthcare and education.

- Provider institutions to Pronatec BSM; SENAI, SENAC, and the IFBA.

According to 2015 data on the absorption of labor and the opening of job vacancies in the most representative economic sectors, the economy in Salvador revealed potential opportunities to develop productive inclusion strategies for the poorest and most vulnerable populations, whether by placement in the formal labor market, or opportunities in individual or collective entrepreneurship.

Salvador launched its activities with Pronatec BSM in 2011. Besides the provider institutions offering the Pronatec courses in Salvador, there are also 28 basic social protection units to disseminate, mobilize, provide guidance, and referrals for the target audiences in their respective territories.

3. DESCRIPTION OF ACTIONS

Pronatec BSM commenced its work with an experimental initiative proposed by the Ministry of Social Development (MDS, in the original acronym). This pilot program included two classes offered in partnership with SENAI as the provider institution.

Thirty-four students whose socioeconomic profiles reflected vulnerability and extreme poverty, including beneficiaries of the Family Grant program and homeless people, were

trained and received certifications. The initiative helped Pronatec BSM make the changes needed to implement the program nationwide. The participation of Salvador in the experience served as a basis for local learning.

In the scope of municipal management, a team linked to social assistance was designated to act exclusively in the realm of mobilizing and pre-enrollment among the target audience of Pronatec BSM.

With the arrival of the Acessuas Trabalho program in 2013, this team was expanded, with a work plan and duties defined. The funding for Acessuas Trabalho made it feasible to pay the teams and form the structures needed to conduct the activities planned for the program to recruit and ensure that the population would participate in Pronatec BSM's courses.

To support the municipalities, the Brazil Without Extreme Poverty Plan created the National Program for Promoting Access to the Work World (Acessuas Trabalho), which transfers federal resources to carry out actions that contribute to integrating social services beneficiaries into the workforce. This program mobilizes, tracks, and monitors the career paths of its students, working in the realms of labor, entrepreneurship, the solidarity economy, and other employment policies in the municipality. As of 2014, 1,379 municipalities had joined Acessuas Trabalho.

In the same time period, the municipal management decided to centralize Pronatec's operations, in all of its diverse aspects, in social assistance. The Acessuas team began to be called the Pronatec Reference team, in this way, allowing the social welfare services to develop their processes in a coordinated fashion.

LEARN MORE

The Pronatec Reference team came to consist of 23 professionals, including social workers, psychologists, and teachers.

The Pronatec Reference Team acts in conjunction with the provider institutions to define the courses and spots open, decide on where to hold the remote classes, providing supervision for the enrollment and the students throughout the course (with institutional visits and social services), and granting certifications for participating students.

With 28 basic social protection units spread throughout the city, the social welfare and entities and teams became deeply involved in activities to disseminate the programs in the communities and the target audiences and recruit students to take part in the courses.

The social welfare public policy is run by way of a network of services that are part of the Unified Social Assistance System (SUAS, in the original acronym).

As a public service assigned to serve the poorest and most vulnerable Brazilians, this social welfare network has gradually expanded nationwide, achieving the capillarity needed for actions aimed at overcoming extreme poverty.

Moreover, the partnership approach to the network and supply of social welfare services (which are jointly funded by the federal government, the states, and the municipalities) is essential to the system.

The Social Development Ministry (MDS, in the original acronym) represents the federal government in managing SUAS. However, it is at the municipal level where the social welfare network liaises directly with the population, as municipalities are responsible for adding families to the Unified Registry with the support of the states.

Mobilization of the priority population takes place primarily through the municipality's basic social protection units, with widespread articulation and dissemination throughout the territories, acting in the realms of dissemination, providing guidance, and referring the public to enroll in the courses.

The main people recruited to enroll in the course are members of beneficiary families of the Family Grant program, social welfare service beneficiaries, and those who fit the Unified Registry profile.

Vulnerable and traditional communities, such as the *terreiro* people,⁵ have been recruited to participate. In fact, decentralized pre-enrollment activities have been conducted to reach these specific communities.

LEARN MORE

With more than 80% of the population of African descent, Salvador is considered the most African city in the world outside of the African continent.

With the capillarity provided by the actions of the 28 basic social protection units in their respective territories, a broad network of local and community-based entities has engaged in the processes of dissemination and mobilization, between public institutions and civil society, neighborhood organizations, churches,

⁵ Families belonging to *terreiro* communities live in traditional African homes, known as *terreiro* homes. In this space, communities with common features live together, such as respect for ancestors, maintaining traditional African values, such as generosity and solidarity, a broad concept of family and a close relationship with the environment. These communities have a very different culture and their own social organizations, derived from the Afro-Brazilian cultural heritage.

terreiros, and more. On some occasions, they contributed with lending structures and facilities for pre-enrollment and even classrooms for the local program course offerings.

Through advance articulation and mobilization, social welfare teams and structures were moved to the territories to do pre-enrollment and provide other guidance. Following the pre-enrollment procedure, the users are referred to the provider institution to confirm enrollment. Enrollment confirmation is done at the headquarters of the provider institutions.

LEARN MORE

The social welfare units are still working on procedures to include families in the Unified Registry, not only as a way to help them access Pronatec BSM courses, but also so they can participate in the broader set of policies targeting the Unified Registry profile.

Something else that characterized the Pronatec implementation in Salvador is the connection between the municipal social welfare policy and the municipal job and employment policy.

Acting as the municipal employment agency, SIMM maintains a structure consisting of three service centers strategically located throughout the city and one traveling station.

With teams, units, and areas set up to receive and serve the population, SIMM plays the role of running the pre-enrollment processes for the population taking Pronatec courses.

LEARN MORE

SIMM began its relationship with Pronatec back in 2011, with the arrival of the program to Salvador. At that point in time, two employees were moved there to provide Pronatec services.

In 2015, the main SIMM center, which was the most visited, as it was located downtown, had 21 service counters. The other two had seven service counters each.

Starting in 2013, with the increase in the number of spots agreed upon with the municipality, all of the SIMM structures and teams were mobilized to do pre-enrollment. The teams were trained and service structures reinforced and adapted to serve the population.

In Salvador, there are Pronatec course spots tied to MDS, the Ministry of Development, Industry, and Foreign Trade (MDIC, in the original acronym), and the Ministry of Education (MEC, in the original acronym), including technical courses and the Thousand Women program (*Mulheres Mil*).

Created in 2011, the Thousand Women Program is one of the Pronatec courses. The Thousand Women program aims to expand the professional training options available to low-income women especially to those who are also beneficiaries of the Family Grant program.

The exception is Pronatec Tourism, which, with the World Cup held in 2014 in Brazil, was maintained under the management of the Municipal Secretariat of Culture and Tourism (*Secretaria Municipal de Cultura e Turismo*).

Aligned with SEMPS, the course provider institutions (SENAI, SENAC, and IFBA) have made an effort to offer courses that are more compatible with the local job market demands and the profiles of the program's target audience.

In this way, courses have been offered in trade, services, industry, languages, civil construction, infrastructure, mechanics, and electricity, including the following jobs: construction carpenter, industrial low-voltage electricity installer, production planning and control assistant, warehouse manager, industrial electrician, quality inspection agent, pastry chef, bricklayer, transport assistant, nutrition advi-

sor, administrative assistant, bartender, seamstress, waiter, computer operator, telephone service operator, pizza chef, receptionist.

To help shape the regulations of the program, these institutions offered up their own structures and experiences in professional and technology education. They also act to receive students and confirm enrollment, put together the teaching corps, find classrooms, labs, and teaching materials used, as well as ensure that the equipment and teams are available and moved to the remote class locations.

The provider institutions also pay the student subsidies⁶, and, alongside the Pronatec Reference team, coach students on their performance, monitor attendance, and work to resolve difficulties and prevent dropout.

The students are given coaching throughout their entire time in the courses with institutional visits, social sessions at the provider institutions and also at remote courses.

The social sessions offered by the municipality take place on a weekly basis depending on the dates and schedules agreed upon with the provider institutions. These sessions are used to provide orientation, services, and referrals. The social sessions have become a sort of "listening session," where students can come and get information or even file complaints. These social sessions have been set up at the SIMM units during pre-enrollment periods.

⁶ The federal government, besides ensuring that Pronatec BSM's course offerings are free, allocates funding for the teaching materials and student aid (meals and transport).

Among the municipal actors involved in the development of Pronatec BSM is the Municipal Secretariat of Education and Culture (Secretaria Municipal de Educação e Cultura). As a social welfare partner, it participates to promote schooling for the program's priority audience.

It works on the assumption that raising the level of schooling facilitates access for the priority audience to the Pronatec BSM courses and expands opportunities for learning, raising the likelihood that students stay in the classroom. Moreover, it helps to level the playing field for students applying for job vacancies.

Besides this, the Secretariat of Education contributed to expanding the number of spots available for Youth and Adult Education (EJA, in the original acronym) in the territories, as well as in providing classrooms in the municipal education network for the decentralized course offerings.

Among the set of measures and articulations developed in Salvador to implement Pronatec BSM, of note were the capillarity and capacity to mobilize the target audience based on activities at the municipal basic social protection units and welfare network and the decentralization and engagement of diverse public and community-based institutions in doing pre-enrollment for the course offerings.

4. CHALLENGES FACED/ LESSONS LEARNED

Pronatec BSM primarily recruits and enrolls members of beneficiary families of the Family Grant program, social welfare service beneficiaries, and those who match the Unified Registry profile.

Considering the size of the population in the outskirts of the city and the poor areas of Salvador, it is clearly a challenge to design specific strategies to reach the program's target population, as well as to develop mechanisms to track and follow up on the career paths of these groups over time.

During the courses, the principal challenges faced were students' low levels of schooling, their lack of knowledge at the beginning about the course, and the incompatibility of profiles and interests, the difficulty to adapt to school routines, and delays and problems with paying the scholarships.

The provider institutions dealt with the low level of schooling by using differentiated or tailored assessment instruments. To guarantee access to the courses, they agreed to make some schooling requirements more flexible. For those with no school records, they accept a self-declaration.

In terms of the school adaptation and integration process, two welcoming and leveling modu-

les have been adapted as part of the Thousand Women Program curriculum, and they were extended and reproduced for Pronatec BSM's classes.

IFBA, one of the providers, invested in putting together an interdisciplinary team linked to the Student Aid Program (PAE, in the original acronym), to provide support to students in all of their specific needs, which may include medical or dental care.

An IFBA welcome desk was set up in the only room with a door that opens to the outside of the building. This helps the public to obtain information about the courses without having to go inside of the school.

SENAC, another provider institution, has added 20-hour original and math courses, aiming to alert students to the importance of these two subjects to their professional lives.

IFBA and SENAC, following difficulties regarding scholarship payment procedure, began to use bank transfers. With the support of SEMPS, they set up partnerships with banking institutions to help students open simple accounts.

Because Salvador is a metropolis, there are challenges related to distance and mobility between students' homes and the teaching centers. Situations related to transportation and traffic have caused problems for students to arrive on time. For the night classes, there have been is-

ues with finding transportation home at night to their neighborhoods when the classes end.

For this reason, the choice was made to offer remote classes, outside of the provider institutions' facilities, to bring the courses closer to the communities and territories. These classes are offered at community organization, church flex spaces, or schools belonging to the municipal education network. To provide the classrooms, a Cooperation Agreement was signed between SEMPS and the Municipal Secretariat of Education.

In the municipal government structure, labor and employment and social welfare policies were handled by the same secretariat between 2009 and 2015. When the institutional reorganization separated them, they became divided into SEMPS (social welfare) and SEDES (labor and employment).

During the period when these two secretariats were being created (SEMPS and SEDES), the teams experienced problems in implementing Pronatec BSM due to successive changes in management that impacted the replacement of coordination and teams, and there were various moments of discontinuity.

Despite this, the long-time shared management between social welfare and labor was beneficial to make partnerships for the pre-enrollment process for Pronatec BSM courses (and subsequently others, too), for which the structures of SIMM were used.

With the rising demand on SIMM, there have been problems related to the fact that some public servants have little information about the program. There are also issues related to working with SISTEC⁷, not to mention that some of the clerks attending the public were unprepared or prejudiced, especially towards Pronatec BSM, which is considered “different” from the population group usually served by SIMM.

To resolve these problems, activities and trainings have been conducted to raise sensitivity and awareness among the SIMM teams, consisting of everything from general program information to specific information, such as the number of spots open, the courses available, the schedules, and the provider institutions.

The teams have been trained, primarily, through daily, informal dialogue, during the service process, and whenever questions arose. The SIMM teams were also given instruction about the profile of the Pronatec BSM profile and were trained specifically in how to serve them. Gradually, the initial difficulties were overcome and the SIMM stations fell into a routine for attending Pronatec beneficiaries.

However, the labor and employment policy has still not advanced towards a specific strategy to

promote productive inclusion opportunities for students who graduate from Pronatec in the city. The registry of students who complete Pronatec in the SIMM database is rather done by individual motivation or potential referrals made by the social welfare services and groups.

However, SENAI and SENAC, two of the provider institutions, acting to promote labor intermediation, have set up partnerships with local market sectors, whether that is through dissemination of the courses offered or making the database of students who graduate available when requests come in from companies to hire professionals. As a strategy to support small entrepreneurs, there is a program to connect with the Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises Support Service (SEBRAE, in the original acronym)⁸ to provide technical assistance in dealing with the banks and accessing credit lines.

In summary, placement in the labor market, whether formally or informally, is still perceived as a challenge to effectively developing the strategies and instruments that will match market demands with the profiles of program graduates.

5. SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION

The Pronatec courses have had a major impact in Salvador. With broad dissemination in the local media, the population has begun to demand spots in courses from the municipal government.

⁷ System charged with publishing on a monthly basis information about intermediate-level technology courses, schools, and students.

⁸ SEBRAE contributed training activities in topics related to entrepreneurship, managing small businesses, and formalizing micro-enterprises.

LEARN MORE

Following the experimental courses in 2011, Salvador reached 25,249 enrolled students in Pronatec BSM between January 2012 and December 2014, with the majority of enrollments done by one municipality in this time period.

The development of Pronatec in Salvador, in all of its different modes, has involved various municipal secretariats. In the municipality, there have been Pronatec vacancies tied to the MDS, the Ministry of Development, Industry, and Foreign Trade (MDIC, in the original acronym), and to the Ministry of Education (MEC), between the initial and continuing education technical training courses (FIC, in the original acronym) and the Thousand Women program.

In light of the heterogeneity of situations related to implementation, which have run the gamut from dialogue with the respective ministries and provider institutions, difficulties in mobilizing the specific target audience for each program, the closing of classes, and even disputes among the secretariats, the municipal government decided to centralize coordination for Pronatec in a single secretariat. As such, since 2013, Pronatec has been coordinated as a single program pursuant to the social welfare policy by SEMPS.

⁹ The WWP website has a case study and video posted about the Bahia Better Life Program. For more information, visit www.wwp.org.br.

With this new structure, the program started to standardize its strategies and procedures for everything ranging from dissemination, identification, and mobilization of the public to procedures for pre-enrollment and follow-up with students.

In this context, Acessuas Trabalho has played a major role in all of the initiatives to the development of the program. In Salvador, Acessuas Trabalho has come to be known as the Pronatec Reference Team, which is also contributing to levelling knowledge about the program among the diverse sectors and services involved.

In a strategy to help the basic social protection units, the Pronatec Reference Team decided to provide more personalized assistance at each of the 28 units throughout the municipality. A reference technical advisor has been designated to each unit.

By way of the social welfare units, group activities have been carried out with families and beneficiaries, oriented towards motivational activities and vocational guidance.

The Pronatec Reference Team promotes articulation with other policies, looking for complementarities among actions. With the state government, it has sought support to be included in services such as the Bahia Better Life program (Programa Bahia Vida Melhor⁹), productive inclusion, and solidarity economy initiatives.

In this way, the Pronatec Reference Team in Salvador has become a center of reference for decision-making to the implementation of Pronatec BSM and other programs, acting to level information and build instruments to support the activities of all actors involved.

With a network of 28 basic social protection units distributed throughout the city, the experience in Salvador in implementing Pronatec stands out for the territorial capillarity it has achieved.

With teams working on activities in many neighborhoods and communities throughout the city, a territorial-based dynamic is used to reach social welfare beneficiaries and disseminate information about and mobilize the public to take part in Pronatec courses.

As the demand for Pronatec courses has become one of the principal social welfare needs, the social welfare units have incorporated into their routines instruments and practices to engage in outreach with the population interested in the program. In aligned action with the Pronatec Reference Team, these units are involved in dissemination, mobilization, and referrals for the public to enroll in these courses.

In the day-to-day services, a practice was adopted of consulting and recording interest in courses by visiting their homes or by telephone. This has made it possible to target the interested people once there were vacancies available.

The practice of consulting and recording the course demand serves also as a negotiating instrument with the provider institutions to obtain courses in the areas and topics of interest to the population. This is useful when defining the courses to be offered.

Among the set of strategies implemented by municipal management to expand the channels of access to the population, it is worthwhile to highlight the SIMM centers used for pre-enrollment. With teams and structures distributed throughout three service centers strategically located around the city, plus one traveling center, they have been able to accelerate orientation, referrals, and services between the basic social protection units and SIMM.

LEARN MORE

At peak pre-enrollment times, SIMM receives support from the Pronatec Reference Team. Even when there are no open spots, SIMM continues to provide guidance and clarifications.

While the courses are being offered, activities are conducted with the instructors to raise awareness about and sensitivity towards the profile of the Pronatec audience and underscore the importance of alternative teaching methods that foster integration and support learning and constant motivation in the classroom, as well as preventing dropout.

There has also been informal dialogue with the instructors and teaching teams at the provider institutions, offering feedback from the teams in terms of how the program is being run. This dialogue helps identify and resolve situations such as the lack of or inadequacy of equipment or individual protection items missing in the courses.

The instructors and teaching teams at the provider institutions also contribute to control atten-

dance and absences, acting alongside the Pronatec Reference team to prevent dropouts and support students facing difficult circumstances.

Finally, it is important to note that, beyond the municipal management structures, what helped Pronatec to achieve a significant number of enrollments was the installed capacity of the provider institutions to act in the city, and to receive the enrolled students, whether at the centralized or remote units.

ipea Institute for Applied
Economic Research

MINISTRY OF
**SOCIAL AND AGRARIAN
DEVELOPMENT**



WWP.ORG.BR/EN